SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND POLICY PRESCRIPTIONS

The aim of this chapter is to summarize the major findings of the study and also to put forth recommendations for improving the performance of local self governance.

The chapter has been organized into four parts. Part I summarizes the rationale of the study. The review of literature; inadequacies of the earlier studies; scope and period of the study; objectives; hypothesis; and research methodology has been mentioned in part II of chapter. The part III covers gist of the major findings. The last part of the chapter offers a set of policy prescriptions.

I
RATIONALE OF THE STUDY

Local governments in India especially after the 73rd and 74th Constitutional Amendments are playing a vital role in providing local services to the citizens in their jurisdictions. The last few decades have seen a massive expansion in the urban areas across the country. The expectations of citizens from the municipal governments in urban areas are rising. Municipalities around the country are gearing up to meet these expectations. It is therefore important to make an assessment about the performance of these bodies as well as to find out the perceptions of citizens about the quality of the services provided to them. It is in this backdrop that the present study has been undertaken.

II
REVIEW OF LITERATURE

With a view to comprehend various facets of the research problem and identify the limitations of the earlier studies, a review of several research papers, books and reports was undertaken.
INADEQUACIES OF EARLIER LITERATURE AND APPROACH FOR OVERCOMING THE INADEQUACIES

The review of literature reveals that most of the earlier studies have focused basically on one or two aspects of the urban local bodies at a time. For example the previous studies have focused either on structural or on procedural or on financial aspects, but none of the earlier works has attempted to study the overall performance of urban local bodies by focusing on delivery of municipal services from citizens perspective. Further, the previous studies have not made an attempt to assess the performance of local government on the basis of benchmarks for service delivery.

The present study aims to evaluate the overall performance of urban local body, namely Municipal Council, Panchkula by covering organizational, financial and physical aspects relating to select municipal services. In addition, the study also focuses on measuring the satisfaction level of citizens towards the basic services being provided by Municipal Council, Panchkula. Moreover, the present study has attempted to analyse the performance of MCP regarding service delivery on the basis of comparison with select benchmarks.

Scope of the Study

Urban local self government provides number of services which has direct impact on citizens. The subject matter of urban local self government after 74th Constitutional has become so wide, complex and dynamic that it would have been most difficult to delve into the complete study of all the services provided by urban local self government. The present study therefore due to time and resource constraints has confined only to sanitation, roads, parks, streetlights and fire brigade services provided by Municipal Council, Panchkula.

Period of the Study

The MCP was established in 2001 and almost a decade has passed since its inception. Therefore the study period covered a decade of MCP functioning i.e. 2001 to 2010.

OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

The objectives of the study are to:

1. examine the organizational structure of Municipal Council, Panchkula;
2. study the Personnel Administration of the Municipal Council, Panchkula;
3. review how efficiently the Municipal Council Panchkula is managing its finances;
4. analyze the physical performance of Municipal Council, Panchkula;
5. examine the level of satisfaction of citizens regarding basic services; and
6. suggest policy prescriptions for improving the performance of Municipal Council, Panchkula.

**HYPOTHESES OF THE STUDY**

In the present study, an attempt has been made to test the following hypotheses

1. The organizational structure of Municipal Council, Panchkula is not conducive to performance.
2. The employees of Municipal Council, Panchkula are dissatisfied with the personnel policy of the Council.
3. The Municipal Council, Panchkula does not manage its financial resources properly.
4. The sources of income of MCP are inadequate resulting in its overdependence upon grants in aid.
5. The physical performance of Municipal Council Panchkula is not satisfactory.
6. Users of services of Municipal Council Panchkula are not satisfied with the quality of services.

**RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

The study is based on both primary as well as secondary data. The primary data was collected from 305 respondents spread over urban, rural and slum areas, through a structured questionnaire. The breakup of the respondents include 200 from the urban areas, 80 from the rural areas and 25 from slum areas which were chosen by means of simple random sampling. Amongst the urban areas, sectors in the city were grouped into three categories on the basis of level of prosperity: (i) posh area; (ii) other sector; and (iii) village and colony. One sector from each was selected. On the other hand, villages were included in the sample on the basis of distance i.e. one village each in close proximity to Municipal Council, Panchkula and one Village each
at maximum distance. In the case of colonies, biggest slum in the municipal area, namely, Rajiv Colony was included in the sample for study.

The objective for collecting primary data in this regard was to assess the users satisfaction about the quality of services provided by the MCP. In addition to the questionnaire, pictorial depictions, content analysis of news reports, the primary data was also collected from 79 employees of MCP (58 permanent and 21 contractual) to assess their level of satisfaction regarding the personnel policy of MCP.

In addition, various officials of MCP, President, former President and 16 Councilors (present and former) were also interviewed. Observation method was also used to supplement the data collected through various tools as mentioned above.

The secondary data was collected from various sources which included Audit and Annual Reports of MCP, Citizen Charter, Municipal Act of Haryana 1973 and the official documents relating to sanitation, parks, fire brigades, streetlight and roads of MCP. The secondary data was also collected from the official documents of Directorate of Urban Local Bodies Haryana, Directorate of Local Bodies Audit and Office of State Finance Commission, Haryana. The assessment of physical performance of MCP with regard to select services has been undertaken by comparing the existing position of MCP regarding these services vis-à-vis the select parameters for the provision of these services.

The data thus collected was analysed after classification, coding, editing, and tabulation by using SPSS package, and interpreted to test the hypotheses. Chi square was also used to check the association between selected variables.

III

MAJOR FINDINGS

Findings of the study alongwith status of hypotheses have been presented in chapter-wise as under.

A. Organizational Structure and Functioning

Organizational structure of MCP has been divided into Deliberative wing and Executive wing. Deliberative wings contains councilors and Executive wing has
several branches. The major findings with regard to the organizational and functioning are summed as under:

The study found that the MCP has constituted it’s Deliberative wing as well as Executive Wing. However, it has not constituted any sub-committee which could have played an important role in improving the effectiveness and functioning of MCP. Further, the study found that there is lack of proper coordination between its different branches impacting its performance. Moreover, in terms of task allocation, the study reveals that no proper rationale has been used. Some branches of the MCP have been over burdened in contrast to others which have been allocated only few tasks. Also the structure has no in-built mechanisms for proper supervision.

Unfair means while electing the President in the Council are galore. Democracy does not exist in letter and spirit when it comes to the election of President and the Council. Judiciary has also taken cognizance of it. Many times President has been removed from his post during his tenure by the Government. In some cases even court has ruled that the removal of President by the Government is illegal and ordered the reinstatement of the President.

The study reveals that scheduled meetings of Council are not conducted according to given stipulated time. The interval between two meetings is generally large. Between the years 2001-2010 on an average only 3 meetings were held. The absence of President is one of the reasons for not conducting meetings regularly. There is a provision in the Haryana Municipal Act, 1973 that if President and Vice President are not available, then councilors can elect one amongst themselves as a chairman. But, this provision is violated due to political motive and lack of clearly defined procedure. Another reason is lack of quorum for the meeting which is 1/10 of total members. The councilors do not have much interest to attend the meetings and hence the quorum suffers.

Honorarium of members is also not adequate and it is another factor affecting the functioning of the Council.

Council has not constituted sub-committees for carrying out its responsibility; this affects its working in terms of economy, effectiveness and efficiency. It is
relevant to mention here that the Haryana Municipal Act, 1973 has the provisions for constituting the sub-committees for Municipal Council, Panchkula.

Engineering branch is over burdened as it has to perform a large number of functions dealing with parks, roads, and work regarding passing maps. There is no separate branch of MCP for catering to the park services.

It is also found that in some cases, the resolutions passed by the Council are manipulated by the Executive wing at the time of implementation. For example it has been found that, the executive wing sometimes draws extra money from the municipal funds than the sanctioned amount.

It is also found in the study that due to shortage of employees the MCP has a larger span of control in its organizational structure.

The study, reveals that there was no separate public relations branch of MCP to handle the grievances of citizens and to provide citizen centric inputs to MCP.

**Testing of Hypothesis 1:**

The analysis of secondary data was used to check the status of Hypothesis 1: “The organizational structure of Municipal Council, Panchkula is not conducive to performance”.

According to S K Bhatacharya¹, an organization structure having following features is conducive for performance:

i) Effective task allocation.

ii) Proper coordination.

iii) Proper supervision.

iv) Formation of smaller task groups.

As mentioned above in order to be conducive to performance, an organizational structure should have effective task allocation. In case of MCP, it has been found that some of the branches have been allocated work disproportionate to their capacity to perform. For example, the Engineering Branch of MCP has not only to look after the large area relating to roads (405 kilometers) in the MCP jurisdiction,

---

¹ Bhattacharya, S. K. *op. cit.*
but it has also been allocated tasks related to the all around development and maintenance of around 200 parks.

Secondly, proper coordination is another significant determinant for the conducive performance of any organization. The study shows that in MCP, there are cases of lack of coordination between Deliberative wing and Executive wing as well as between different branches of the MCP. For example, during the interview the Councilors have expressed opinion that the policies formulated by the deliberative wing are not properly executed by the MCP staff and due to weak coordination between both the wings. Further, the study shows lack of coordination between Accounts Branch and Engineering Branch with regard to payments to the contractors particularly to the Park Development Societies.

The literature also shows that for conducive performance, structure should facilitate supervision. In case of supervision, the study reveals that in MCP, there is lack of proper supervision on the part of the Council due to inadequate number of Sanitary Inspectors and Junior Engineers for Sanitation and Electrical Branches respectively. In the case of sanitation services the areas under MCP jurisdiction have been divided into 2 sanitary zones but in MCP a post of Sanitary Inspector is lying vacant. Further, only 2 Saffai Darogas have to supervise a large area i.e. 39.5 square kilometer area covering 1,90,000 population. Also, for street light, one Junior Engineer has to look after as many as 10,000 street light points.

Formation of smaller task groups or sub-committees results in good organizational performance. The study suggests that MCP has failed to set-up sub-committees or smaller task groups. It is relevant to mention here that the Haryana Municipal Act, 1973 authorizes urban local governments to constitute sub committees for effective functioning in different fields. MCP has not implemented this provision of the Act.

Thus, the evaluation of MCP on the basis of above mentioned parameters suggests that the existing organizational structure of MCP is at variance with the organizational structure’s conducive performance. In the light of this the hypothesis 1, namely, “The organizational structure of Municipal Council Panchkula is not conducive to performance” stands validated.
B. Personnel Administration

The personnel administration of the MCP suffer on many accounts.

Shortage of staff is the major impediment in the way of performance of MCP. About 44.2% of posts in MCP are lying vacant in its various wings. The present staff is not in a position to deliver time bound services to the citizens and thus the performance of MCP gets adversely affected.

There is no proper system of classification for employees of MCP. Discussion with the employees reveal that they do not know about their position/rank in the classification.

Since long the MCP has not recruited new staff. Recruitment Rules are very old; and thus the qualifications required for particular posts are not as per requirements of present job scenario.

Frequent transfers at the senior levels of MCP have been noticed. A long gap has been observed in filling the posts which got vacated due to transfers. This affects the working of MCP adversely.

No appropriate policy of deputation has been adopted by MCP for filling the vacant posts through deputation.

Capacity building of the employees suffers the most in MCP. No separate institute for providing training to the employees of the Municipalities including MCP has been set up in Haryana. The Higher officials of the MCP are imparted training at Haryana Institute of Public Administration (HIPA). However, there is no provision for training lower level employees in MCP. The employees learn their job responsibilities through hit and trial basis. It is found during study that only one employee i.e. an Accountant got training between year 2001 to 2010.

The study shows that promotional avenues for lower level employees are very few. This affects their morale adversely.

In cases of indiscipline in MCP the disciplinary actions are taken in rare cases. Even in those cases, employees try to use political and other influences to escape the disciplinary proceedings.
Testing of Hypothesis 2:

The analysis of both primary and secondary data is used to check the status of Hypothesis 2: “The employees of Municipal Council Panchkula are dissatisfied with the personnel policy of the Council”. This hypothesis has been split into sub-hypotheses, covering areas such as recruitment policy; classification system; pay scale policy; training system; promotion system; leave system; fringe benefit system; disciplinary action; service conditions; management employees relation; and working hours.

More than half of the total permanent employees reported that they were not satisfied with the personnel policy of the MCP. In the case of Contractual employees 100 percent reported dissatisfaction about recruitment policy, working hours, pay scale policy, leave system and service conditions. The major findings have been summarized in the Matrix below:

**Matrix summing the Testing of Hypothesis 2**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. No.</th>
<th>Sub hypothesis</th>
<th>Sources of data</th>
<th>Analysis</th>
<th>Status of Sub Hypothesis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Employees of MCP are not satisfied with recruitment Policy</td>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>1. Permanent employees: About 48% employees are dissatisfied with recruitment policy and 22 percent were indifferent &lt;br&gt;2. Contractual employees: About 90% employees are dissatisfied and very few are indifferent towards recruitment policy</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Employees of MCP are not satisfied with classification system</td>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>Permanent employees: About 66% employees are dissatisfied with classification system</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Employees of MCP are not satisfied with pay scale policy</td>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>1. Permanent employees: Around 80 percent</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sr. No.</td>
<td>Sub hypothesis</td>
<td>Sources of data</td>
<td>Analysis</td>
<td>Status of Sub Hypothesis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 4.     | Employees of MCP are not satisfied with training policy | Primary         | employees are dissatisfied with pay scale policy
2.Contractual employees: All the contractual employees are dissatisfied with pay scale policy                                                                                                             | ✔️                      |
| 5.     | Employees of MCP are not satisfied with transfer Policy | Primary         | Permanent employees: Around 71 percent employees are dissatisfied with training policy                                                                                                                  | ✔️                      |
| 6.     | Employees of MCP are not satisfied with promotion policy | Primary         | Permanent employees: About 73 percent employees are dissatisfied with transfer policy                                                                                                                  | ✔️                      |
| 7.     | Employees of MCP are not satisfied with leave system   | Primary         | 1.Permanent employees: About 81% employees are dissatisfied with leave system
2.Contractual employees: All the contractual employees are dissatisfied with leave system                                                                                                           | ✔️                      |
<p>| 8.     | Employees of MCP are not satisfied with fringe benefits system | Primary         | 1.Permanent employees: About 78% employees are dissatisfied with fringe benefits system                                                                                                               | ✔️                      |
| 9.     | Employees of MCP are not satisfied with disciplinary action | Primary         | 1.Permanent employees: About 63%                                                                                                                                                                | ✔️                      |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. No.</th>
<th>Sub hypothesis</th>
<th>Sources of data</th>
<th>Analysis</th>
<th>Status of Sub Hypothesis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>employees are dissatisfied with disciplinary action system</td>
<td>✓ Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2. Contractual employees: About 71% employees are dissatisfied and only 29% are indifferent with disciplinary action system</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Employees of MCP are not satisfied with service conditions</td>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>1. Permanent employees: About 84% employees are dissatisfied with promotion policy</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2. Contractual employees: All the contractual employees are dissatisfied with service conditions</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Employees of MCP are not satisfied with management employees relation</td>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>1. Permanent employees: About 71% employees are dissatisfied with management employer relations</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2. Contractual employees: About 53% employees are dissatisfied with management – employer relations</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Employees of MCP are not satisfied with Working hours</td>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>Contractual employees: All the contractual employees are dissatisfied with working hours</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Thus, on the basis of the above analysis of sub hypotheses, the Hypothesis 2: “The employees of Municipal Council Panchkula are dissatisfied with the personnel policy of the Council” is accepted.

C. Financial Administration

The findings of the study regarding financial administration reveal that though, budget of the MCP is passed regularly, but it is not implemented in stipulated time mainly because the permission is not granted timely by the State Government through District administration. This leads to spending of lesser money vis-à-vis allocated in the budget and finally result in poor performance of MCP.

The study also shows that the income of MCP between 2001-2010 has fluctuated.

It has also been found that the area of obligatory taxes is constrained by the policies of state government. Another revealing finding is the huge gap between estimated and actual income both in case of major and minor sources of income of MCP. State government has got special power regarding taxation through Municipal Act of Haryana. Sometimes these powers are misused in terms of tax modification under considerations other than merit.

In this way the concentration of power in the hands of state government to allow the raising of resources through taxation adversely affects the fiscal health of MCP.

The study reports that grants-in aid are not major source to the income of MCP. Their share was merely 2.20 per cent of total income between 2001 to 2010. Further, the State Finance Commissions are not set up on regular basis as stipulated in the Act, as a result, MCP received its share of grants only for one year despite the recommendations covered five years.

Another revealing finding of the study is that non developmental expenditure consumes maximum revenue and as a result development work of the city suffers.

The study shows that there was imbalance of expenditure of select services. For instance if Rs.100 were spent on the five basic services of MCP between 2001 to
2010 then Rs.57.53 were allocated for roads, Rs. 12.88 for sanitation, Rs. 13.65 for Parks, Rs. 4.95 for street lights and Rs. 1.60 for fire brigade implying thereby that the distribution of resources of these services were not in adequate proportion.

There is no proper system of maintenance of accounts in MCP.

Further the audit objections are not properly cleared by the MCP. There is no proper coordination between audit and accounts branch of MCP.

Testing of Hypotheses 3 & 4

The analysis of both primary and secondary data is used to check the status of Hypothesis 3: “The Municipal Council, Panchkula does not manage its financial resources properly” and Hypothesis 4 “The sources of income of Municipal Council Panchkula are inadequate resulting in its over dependence upon grants-in-aid”.

Matrix Summing the Testing of Hypothesis 3 & 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesis</th>
<th>Sub hypothesis</th>
<th>Sources of data</th>
<th>Analysis</th>
<th>Status of Sub Hypothesis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hypothesis 3:</strong> The Municipal Council, Panchkula does not manage its financial resources properly</td>
<td>I. The MCP does not prepare budget estimates properly especially in case of taxes.</td>
<td>Secondary data</td>
<td>The data about major and minor heads of income from taxes shows huge variation between the budgeted estimates and actual income, thereby reflecting lack of undertaking scientific exercise to estimate revenue from taxes and also indicating poor tax compliance. This trend is particularly visible in case of development work wherein on an average only 22.53 % of estimated taxes are actually realized between 2001 and 2009. In case of minor heads the actual income from fire tax, interest on investment, rent of shops and electricity duty has always been much higher than budgeted estimates. For example between year</td>
<td>☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hypothesis</td>
<td>Sub hypothesis</td>
<td>Sources of data</td>
<td>Analysis</td>
<td>Status of Sub Hypothesis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2001-09, the income from the fire tax, interest on investment, rent of shops and electricity duty as percentage of budgeted estimates was 3481 percent, 280 percent, 135 percent and 104.9 percent respectively. In case of road cut charges, tehbazari malba and composition fees, it was 1513 percent, 228 percent and 172 percent of the budgeted estimates respectively.</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Non developmental expenditure consumes maximum revenue and in the process the development of the city suffered</td>
<td>Secondary data</td>
<td>The ratio of development expenditure to the non-development expenditure has been low. The average of development expenditure as a percentage of non-development for the years 2001 to 2010 was only 8.2%, 25.5%, 36.5%, 26.2%, 24.7%, 21.80%, 20.82%, 18.30% and 17.08% respectively.</td>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. There is an imbalance in the expenditure on select services by MCP.</td>
<td>Secondary data</td>
<td>There is an imbalance in expenditure on select service delivered by MCP. For example over the years the expenditure on roads has been larger than that on other services like sanitation, parks, street lights and fire services. The expenditure on road as a percentage of development expenditure for the years from 2001 to 2010 was 60.5%, 13.40%, 15.09%, 4.87%, 1.79% respectively. If Rs. 100 were spent between 2001 to 2010 for select services, Rs. 57.53 were allocated for road, Rs. 12.88 for sanitation, Rs. 13.65 for</td>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hypothesis</td>
<td>Sub hypothesis</td>
<td>Sources of data</td>
<td>Analysis</td>
<td>Status of Sub Hypothesis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hypothesis 3: “The Municipal Council Panchkula does not manage its financial resources properly”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Parks, Rs. 4.95 for street light and Rs. 1.60 for fire brigade.</td>
<td>✗</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hypothesis 4: The source of income of MCP are inadequate resulting in its over dependence upon grants-in-aid</td>
<td>Secondary data</td>
<td>The contribution of grant-in-aid received by the MCP as a percentage of total income is only 2.9% (average of the period 2001-2009). During the period 2001-2004, MCP did not receive grant-in-aid.</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Thus, on the basis of the above analysis of sub hypothesis, the Hypothesis 3: “The Municipal Council Panchkula does not manage its financial resources properly” stands validated and Hypothesis 4: “The sources of income of Municipal Council Panchkula are inadequate resulting in its over dependence upon grants-in-aid” got rejected.

D. Physical Performance

The physical performance of the MCP is not satisfactory. Many factors are contributing towards poor performance of MCP on the basis of physical indicators. The status of physical performance of MCP has been studied as under:

Testing of Hypothesis 5

For evaluating the status of the Hypothesis 5: “The physical performance of Municipal Council Panchkula in not satisfactory” the results have been summarized in the Matrix.

Matrix Summing up the Status of Hypothesis 5

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub hypothesis</th>
<th>Source of data</th>
<th>Analysis</th>
<th>Status of Sub Hypothesis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| (i) Physical performance of MCP with regard to sanitation services is not satisfactory due to drastic decline | Primary and Secondary data | • In 2001 MCP had 290 equipment which increased marginally to 292 in 2010.  
• Equipment per 1000 population suggest that the same declined drastically from 193 to 153 | ✗ |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub hypothesis</th>
<th>Source of data</th>
<th>Analysis</th>
<th>Status of Sub Hypothesis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| over time in physical equipment per thousand population, inadequate manpower, lack of modern waste management methods and deviation of provision of sanitation services from the prescribed benchmarks. | between 2001 and 2010.  
- Further it was found that no practice of segregation of waste, recycling and incineration of waste was adopted by the MCP.  
- Pictorial depictions indicate worse conditions of sanitation services specifically in villages and colonies.  
- Sanitation services are not extended to 30 percent of the population.  
- Collection of waste was 50% of the total.  
- Disposal of waste 70% against the standards of 100%.  
- Number of Disposal Bins 1/1373 population against the norm of 1/75.  
- Number of sanitary workers was 1.54 per thousand population against the benchmark of 2.8. | ☑ Valid |
| (ii) Physical performance of MCP with regard to road services is not satisfactory on account of lack of inadequate manpower, physical equipment, poor maintenance of roads, improper monitoring of the contractual work and provision of road services not according to the benchmarks. | Primary and secondary data | The Engineering Branch has only 3 employees against the requirement of 20 employees.  
- Further the existing staff of Engineering Branch is mainly non-technical and cannot ensure compliance of terms and conditions of the contracts.  
- Between 2001 to 2010 only 186 km roads were repaired and maintained.  
- MCP has no equipment of its own for road services. It mainly depends upon equipment of contractors which are many time made available slowly.  
- District Administration Reports and Urban Estate Department Reports of Haryana were very critical of road services.  
- Pictorial depictions indicate very bad conditions of roads in MCP jurisdiction.  
- In MCP, there are only 2.11 km roads per thousand population against the prescribed benchmark of 11.09 km roads. Roads cover only 70% of the | ☑ Valid |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub hypothesis</th>
<th>Source of data</th>
<th>Analysis</th>
<th>Status of Sub Hypothesis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(iii) Physical performance of MCP in terms of Street light services is not satisfactory owing to inadequate physical equipment, shortage of employees, negligence by MCP, the provision of services not in consonance with increase in population, poor monitoring and standard of street light services not being as per the prescribed standards.</td>
<td>Primary and secondary data</td>
<td>- The Electrical Branch has only 2 employees against the requirement of 58 employees. &lt;br&gt; - Further the existing staff of Engineering Branch is mainly non technical and cannot ensure compliance of terms and conditions of the contracts. &lt;br&gt; - The number of street lights was 8607 in 2001 which increased only to 8763 in 2010 thus adding only 156 street lights. &lt;br&gt; - Street lights per thousand of population clearly suggests that MCP has failed to provide street lights in tune with growing population. &lt;br&gt; - Street lights per thousand were only 44.75 in 2001 which declined drastically to 21.68 in 2010. &lt;br&gt; - Between 2001 to 2010 physical equipment with Electrical Branch remained three only. &lt;br&gt; - Pictorial depiction indicates very bad conditions of Street light in MCP jurisdiction. &lt;br&gt; - Distance between two poles was not as per the benchmarks. The distance between two poles should be 28 meters, whereas, in case of MCP, the distance is of 35 meters. &lt;br&gt; - The number of contractual workers was 13 in 2001, which increased only to 21 in 2010. During this period population of Panchkula increased manifold. &lt;br&gt; - Performance of MCP on account of street lights is not satisfactory as per the report of District administration and Urban Estate Department of Haryana.</td>
<td>☑ Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sub hypothesis</td>
<td>Source of data</td>
<td>Analysis</td>
<td>Status of Sub Hypothesis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| equipment, absence of upgradation and modernization, inadequate manpower and provision of fire services not being in consonance with the benchmarks prescribed by National Disaster Management Authority. | Primary and secondary data | equipment with Fire Branch increased from 5 to 7 only. MCP could not upgrade and modernize its physical equipment according to demand of present fire situation.  
- The prescribed norms are 4 fire tenders, 2 water tenders. Against these MCP has only 2 fire tenders and 2 water tenders. | ☑ Valid |
| (v) Physical performance of MCP in terms of park services is not satisfactory owing to inadequate provision of parks viz-a-viz population, absence of physical equipment, non monitoring of the works of Parks Development Society, deprivation of parks services for the resident of colonies and slums, and absence of services in relation to prescribed standard. | | MCP has no separate personnel for catering is to parks services. This function is looked after by Engineering Branch.  
- Further the existing staff of Engineering Branch mainly consists of non technical staff and cannot ensure compliance of terms and conditions of the contracts.  
- Only 78 parks were developed and maintained against the requirement of 204 parks.  
- MCP has no physical equipments for providing park services adequately to residents.  
- Pictorial depictions indicate worse conditions of parks in MCP jurisdiction.  
- In case of villages and colonies there are no parks. MCP has only one park for 250 meters areas against the prescribed benchmarks 2 for same area.  
- No proper physical infrastructure in parks as per the prescribed benchmarks.  
- Urban Estate Department of Haryana finds irregularities in development of park and inferior quality of park in MCP jurisdiction. | ☑ Valid |

Analysis of sub hypotheses reveals that the Hypothesis 5: “The physical performance of Municipal Council Panchkula is not satisfactory” stands validated.
E. CITIZENS’ SATISFACTION

The performance of MCP from the citizens perspective is also not satisfactory. Citizens in villages and colonies are more dissatisfied vis-à-vis those from posh sectors. A brief account of performance of MCP for citizens’ perspective is as under:

In case of Sanitation it is observed that colony is totally neglected. Though, posh areas are more cleaner than other areas. But a large number of citizens of MCP are not satisfied with sanitation services.

In case of street light also most of the citizens are not satisfied. There is no provision of street light in village and colony.

As far as Parks are concerned it is found that there is no provision of parks in rural and colony areas. As far as urban areas are concerned the parks are not well maintained and it results in dissatisfaction of citizens of Panchkula.

Fire brigade services are also poor. In most of the cases the services are not provided promptly.

In case of Road services again most of the people are dissatisfied. Rural areas and colonies are totally neglected as some parts in these areas donot have roads at all. In urban areas, citizens complained about the poor maintenance of roads.

Citizen also have grievances about not handling the complaints promptly.

Testing of Hypothesis 6

For evaluating the status of the Hypothesis 6: “Users of services of Municipal Council Panchkula are not satisfied with the quality of services”, primary data have been used and main hypothesis is splitted into various sub-hypotheses such as: satisfaction of the citizens with the condition of ‘roads'; 'sanitation'; 'street light'; 'parks'; and ‘fire brigade services’. The major findings regarding satisfaction of citizens have been summarized in Matrix.
Matrix Summing up the Testing of Hypothesis 6

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Services and Sub Hypothesis</th>
<th>Sources of Data</th>
<th>Analysis</th>
<th>Status of Sub Hypothesis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Sanitation</td>
<td>Primary Data</td>
<td>A. About 80% of citizens are dissatisfied with Garbage collection. B. Around 75% of citizens are dissatisfied with cleanliness</td>
<td>☑️ Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Users are not satisfied with the provision of sanitation services</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Street Lights</td>
<td>Primary Data</td>
<td>A. About 75% of citizens are dissatisfied with the quality of street lights</td>
<td>☑️ Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Users are not satisfied with the provision of street lights service</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Roads</td>
<td>Primary Data</td>
<td>A. Around 89% of citizens are dissatisfied with the conditions of roads</td>
<td>☑️ Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Users are not satisfied with the quality of roads</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Parks</td>
<td>Primary data</td>
<td>A. Around 59% citizens are dissatisfied with park maintenance.</td>
<td>☑️ Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Users are not satisfied with maintenance of parks</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Fire Brigade services</td>
<td>Primary Data</td>
<td>A. Around 58% of citizens are satisfied with fire prevention services.</td>
<td>☐️ Invalid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Users are not satisfied with quality of fire brigade services</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Users are not satisfied with overall quality of services</td>
<td>Primary Data</td>
<td>A. About 86% of users are dissatisfied with overall quality of services provided by MCP.</td>
<td>☑️ Valid</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Analysis of the sub hypotheses reveals that the main Hypothesis 6: “Users of services of Municipal Council Panchkula are not satisfied with the quality of services” stands validated.

IV

POLICY PRESCRIPTIONS

Based on the findings of the study a number of policy prescriptions have been suggested. The policy prescriptions cover facets such as organizational structure and
functioning of MCP, personal administration, financial administration and physical performance.

A. Organisational Structure and Functioning of MCP

The literature specially Bhattacharya (1989) reveals that the organisation structures are conducive to performance which have proper coordination, effective tasks allocations, proper supervision, and forms smaller task groups. Following policy prescriptions have been made covering these aspects of organizational structure of MCP.

(i) Proper Coordination

The present study reveals lack of coordination between Deliberative and Executive wing on the one hand and among various branches of MCP on the other hand. It is therefore suggested that better coordination be ensured between different wings as well as within branches of MCP for improving its performance.

(ii) Effective Task Allocation

The study reveals that MCP has failed to effectively allocate of the tasks to the different branches and in the process some branches are over-burdened. It is suggested that rational task allocation be done for the various branches of MCP taking into account their mandate, the important functions, budget and manpower.

(iii) Proper Supervision

In MCP, the study showed that the performance suffered due to ineffective supervision. In the light of this it is suggested that MCP should appoint more supervisory staff for ensuring better performance.

(iv) Smaller Task Groups

The formation of smaller task groups are seen as an effective means of carrying out activities by the administrative organizations. The study found that in MCP no such effort has been made. It is relevant to mention here that despite the provision in the Haryana Municipal Act 1973 to create sub-committees for effective functioning. The MCP has not set up the sub committees. It is suggested that MCP should set up need based sub-committees as per the Act. This initiative will certainly help in improving the performance of MCP.
(v) **Regular Meetings**

The study reveals that in MCP on an average only 3-4 meetings are held. It is suggested that 12 meetings of MCP as per statutory provisions should be held each year.

(vi) **Public Relations Branch**

In the light of the study, it is recommended that there should be Public Relations Branch in MCP. This branch should act as a liaison office between MCP and citizens. The suggestions received from the citizens should regularly be conveyed by this branch to MCP for improving its functioning.

(vii) **Grievance Redressal Machinery**

The study clearly suggests that the citizens are not satisfied with the provision and quality of services. MCP does not follow a declared time frame work in attending and disposing of the citizens complaints. It is recommended that MCP should activate its grievance redressal machinery for winning over the confidence of citizens.

B. **Personnel Administration**

The study clearly suggests that MCP has not paid adequate attention to personnel administration. This has resulted in poor performance of MCP. For improving various aspects of personnel administration, the study has suggested the following recommendations:

(i) **Recruitment of Staff on Priority Basis**

Shortage of staff, adversely affects the service delivery of any organisation. In case of MCP shortage of staff is a norm not an exception. The acute shortage of staff has emerged as a stumbling block in the performance of MCP. It is strongly recommended that MCP should launch recruitment drive immediately so that a problem or shortage of staff is solved and confidence of public towards service delivery is restored.

(ii) **Modification of Recruitment Rules**

Improvement in the eligibility conditions for recruitment for better performance of governance. The employees should possess educational qualifications
corresponding to the nature of functions to be performed. In the present context there is need for well qualified man power particularly in the light of quality centric development. The study revealed that the eligibility conditions of recruitment in case of MCP, which are governed by HMIRC, 1988 rules lay down have relatively become out dated. It is therefore suggested that the eligibility conditions for recruitment be improved in tune with the need of the service delivery as per expectations of the citizens.

(iii) Capacity Building of Existing Staff

In the light of changing landscape of organisations and expectations of citizen, it is essential to equip the staff with the latest developments. MCP has failed in this regard. It is suggested that staff may be trained regularly to upgrade their working.

There should be a separate Training Institute for imparting training to municipal employees. The course contents of trainings should reflect the realities of present day municipal administration. MCP must make efforts to train its lower categories of employees as well to improve delivery of services in the field.

(iv) Expediting Disciplinary Action

It has been found that MCP is very lenient with respect to disciplinary action. This practice sends wrong signals. It is therefore suggested that strict disciplinary action must be taken against erring officials and penalty imposed should be carried out without any fear and prejudice.

(v) Transparent Transfer Policy

In MCP, several concerns were shown by its employees regarding the non-transparent and arbitrary transfer policy. In the light of this it is suggested that the transfer decisions about the employees of MCP should be undertaken in an open and transparent manner and frequent transfers should be avoided. This would help to raise the morale of the employees and enable them to concentrate properly on the work.

C. Financial Administration

Financial administration is another casualty in MCP. This specialized area of public policy has not been steered as per the cannons of public financial
administration. For improving the fiscal health of MCP, a couple of policy prescriptions have been made.

(i) **Effective Tax Estimation**

Tax administration plays pivotal role in financial administration. This area, however, is not scientifically handled by MCP. For example, there is glaring gap between tax estimates and actual tax revenue. This considerable gap suggests that both the procedure for estimating tax revenue and tax compliance need to be improved considerably. This qualitative change in the budgetary exercise will help in bringing stability in the revenue of MCP.

(ii) **Balanced Development Expenditure**

At present maximum resources are eaten up by non developmental heads and subsequently development becomes the victims. MCP should make efforts to ensure that there is adequate and balanced allocation of resources under every head specially the heads covering developmental works.

(iii) **Statutory Time Frame for Passing of Budget**

Study suggests that budget of the MCP is approved by District administration often late and thus lot of money during the financial year remain unspent. It is thus suggested that there should be statutory time frame within which the District Administration must approve the budget of the MCP to enable the MCP to implement its programmes as per stipulated time frame.

(iv) **More Obligatory Taxes**

The area of obligatory taxes of MCP should be enlarged so as to make it financially self sufficient. State Government must ensure that any tax exemptions for any category of persons /bodies should not be governed by political considerations. While taking such decisions, the financial health of MCP should be the only criterion.

(v) **Constitution of State Finance Commission within Stipulated Time Frame**

It has been found that Haryana Government does not constitute the State Finance Commission well within time framework. It is recommends that the State Government should constitute Finance Commission on time, so that the MCP can receive grants on time.
(vi) **Proper Audit and Account System**

There should be proper system of record keeping of account of MCP. A mechanism should be evolved whereby reply to audit objections is filed in time and in case of delay a system of imposing fine/penalty on the erring official should be imposed. This is necessary to check the wastage of public money. There should be proper co-ordination between audit and accounts branches for efficient utilization of funds.

**D. Physical Performance**

For improving physical performance of MCP the following policy recommendations have been identified:

(i) **Better Contract Agreement System**

MCP provides many services through contracting out mode. Therefore the contract agreement plays a significant role towards the delivery of services. It is suggested that the contract should be designed in a scientific manner. Each term and condition of the contract be designed in such manner that the violations should automatically result in levying penalty. It should also be ensured in contract agreement that no contractor, should be allowed to leave the contract midway.

(ii) **Regular Inspection of Road Works**

It has been found in the study that the material used for road construction and maintenance is of substandard quality. In the light of this it is suggested that the materials used by contractors should be as per the norms of Public Works Department (PWD). This quality can be ensured only if there is proper and regular supervision. Regular inspection of roads after construction should also become a normal feature of MCP.

(iii) **Monitoring of Park Development Society (PDS)**

The study has mentioned that the maintenance of parks have been contracted out by Municipal Council Panchkula (MCP) to PDS. The working of PDS is not up to the mark mainly due to poor monitoring and supervision system. It is, thus, suggested
that an inspection team be constituted for ensuring compliance of the contract with PDSs.

(iv) More Funds for Basic Services

There has been large scale development and growth of areas under Municipal Council Panchkula. The increasing population has created pressure on the existing infrastructure. It is suggested that the MCP needs to invest heavily in the maintenance as well as expansion of the basic services particularly-streetlights, park and fire services to cope with the increasing pressure of growing population.

(v) Improvement in Physical Equipment

Inadequate physical equipment results in poor performance of MCP. It is suggested that physical equipment related to maintenance and working of MCP should be increased as per expansion in the population being served by MCP. For instance, sanitation, fire brigade, and street light services need addition to physical equipments every year.

(vi) Use of Modern Technology

For sanitation services modern methods like segregation of waste, recycling and incineration of waste be used. Also for fire services, modern technology like advanced ladders and foam water tenders be used.

(vii) Improve Basic Services

MCP must give special attention to provision of sanitation services for the entire city in general and colonies and rural area in particular. There should be provision of street lights and parks in colonies and rural areas. Maintenance of street lighting should be a priority in urban/sectors of the city. Provision of fire brigade services in MCP jurisdiction must be prompt because as the saying goes a stich in time saves nine.